Chapter/Section	Contents and Points to check	Item to be deleted and reason for deletion	Item to be revised and reason for revision	Item to be added and reason for addition
I. Background and purpose	Outline of NOWPAP, WG4 and intended use - Check if the purpose fit in the situation of your country.		‘Are going to cooperate’ revised to ‘ had cooperated Reason: the activity of cooperation between experts will be completed when guideline is ensured, so we should use pluperfect.	‘marine remote sensing monitoring’, to point out which kind of capacity definitely.
II. Eutrophication and satellite remote sensing	-			

Chapter/Section	Contents and Points to check	Item to be deleted and reason for deletion	Item to be revised and reason for revision	Item to be added and reason for addition
1. Introduction	Outline of eutrophication monitoring by remote sensing and its benefits - Check if the reason to use remote sensing for monitoring of eutrophicaion is clearly explained.			How many time did red tide happen in recent year in NOWPAP area? To show the severity of entrophication.
2. Satellite data	-			
2.1 Monitoring parameters	Satellite data Products that can be applied to eutrophication monitoring (Chl-a, SST, K490). - Confirm if the satellite data product are appropriate as parameters for monitoring of eutrophication.			

Annex X - 2

Interim review of NPEC Guideline for Eutrophication Monitoring by RS in China

Chapter/Section	Contents and Points to check	Item to be deleted and reason for deletion	Item to be revised and reason for revision	Item to be added and reason for addition
2.2 Sensors	Sensors that can monitor the aforementioned variables (SeaWiFS, MODIS, AVHRR). - Confirm if the appropriate sensor is included.			
2.3 Obtaining data	How and where to obtain the satellite data products - Check if the explanation on how and where procedures to acquire the data is clear. - Check if the procedure of obtaining data include the entire data product listed in 2-2) Sensors.		‘http://eosdata.gsfc.nasa.gov/data/datapool/’ is revised to ‘http://eosdata.gsfc.nasa.gov/data/datapool/’ ‘the Marine Environment Watch Homepage’ is revised to ‘the exact website address”	

Chapter/Section	Contents and Points to check	Item to be deleted and reason for deletion	Item to be revised and reason for revision	Item to be added and reason for addition
2.4 Data processing method	Description of data processing methods and computational environment (SeaDAS, WIM, Excel). - Check if computational requirement are explained clearly. - Confirm if the algorithm can be applied to the situation of your country.			ENVI and ERDAS, two kinds of professional remote sensing software, which can complete most date process activities. Reason: In China, these two kinds of RS software have been deployed in many relative institute, and most remote sensing technicians are familiar with them.
3. *In situ* data	-			

Chapter/Section	Contents and Points to check	Item to be deleted and reason for deletion	Item to be revised and reason for revision	Item to be added and reason for addition
3.1 Monitoring parameters and measuring method	Monitoring parameters (Chl-a, Nutrients, Temperature, Salinity, Transparency, COD, SS, Water-Leaving Radiance Other items.) and measurement methods - Check if monitoring parameters are appropriate for monitoring of eutrophication - Check if monitoring parameters should be what is commonly used in your country. -			

Chapter/Section	Contents and Points to check	Item to be deleted and reason for deletion	Item to be revised and reason for revision	Item to be added and reason for addition
3.2 Determination of monitoring site and sampling points	How to determine the sampling points for utilizing satellite data (number of sampling points, locations, etc). - Check if the criteria for selecting monitoring site are adequate to clear out eutrophic area in your country.		‘1km’ is revised to ‘ three pixels distance’ Reason: need to consider the effect of neighbor pixel.	
3.3 Monitoring frequency and timing	How to determine the monitoring frequency and timing (periodical/non-periodical, etc). - Check if the frequency and timing is appropriate enough for understanding seasonal variability of oceanic phenomena of your country.			

Chapter/Section	Contents and Points to check	Item to be deleted and reason for deletion	Item to be revised and reason for revision	Item to be added and reason for addition
3.4 Requisites for monitoring and analysis	Systems and equipment required for monitoring and analysis (Personnel, vessels, etc). - Check if the system and equipment fully comply with all the monitoring parameters in 3-1) Monitoring parameters and measuring method			
4. Monitoring and assessment of eutrophication	-			

Chapter/Section	Contents and Points to check	Item to be deleted and reason for deletion	Item to be revised and reason for revision	Item to be added and reason for addition
4.1 Accuracy evaluation	Accuracy evaluation of satellite data (analysis of correlation to *in situ* data). - Confirm if the necessary evaluation method is included. - Indicate specific procedures. - Indicate special notes for analysis (exclusion of abnormal values, etc). - Make a note of other useful perspectives for evaluating analysis results.			c. Analysis of correlation between in situ and satellite SST; d. Analysis of correlation between satellite chl-a concentration and SST reason: Since the SST is one of the important factors which affect the phytoplankton, we shouldni't ignore the SST's effect to entrophication.
4.2 Integration with the existing monitoring system	Evaluation method for understanding the status and cause of eutrophication (correction of satellite data, analysis of interannual variability, etc). - Check if the evaluation			

Chapter/Section	Contents and Points to check	Item to be deleted and reason for deletion	Item to be revised and reason for revision	Item to be added and reason for addition
	method is appropriate - Indicate specific procedure. - Make a note of other useful perspectives for evaluating analysis results.			
5. Appendix 5.1 Table of satellite data product for marine environmental monitoring	List of products that can be utilized for marine environmental monitoring by remote sensing. - Try to prioritize satellite data product by its importance for monitoring of eutrophication. - Indicate costs and organizations that provide the products, etc.			

A few questions:

1.SS, CDOM have quite different contents in different marine area in NOWPAP. Do these two parameters have the same effect in the same concentration level in all NOWPAP area?
2. I think that All in situ parameters should be put out the measurement methods in the guideline.
3. Can we classify the NOWPAP marine area based on the satellite chl-a concentration?!
4. Chinese SEPA conventional monitoring group don't make Water-Leaving Radiance. So, till now, they haven't appropriate equipments to complete this task.